

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission  
Architectural Review Committee  
Meeting Minutes

Date: October 24, 2017

Location: City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, 8<sup>th</sup> Floor Homeland Security Conference Room, New Orleans, Louisiana.

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Adjourned: 3:10 p.m.

Members present: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Members absent:

**I. AGENDA**

1. Approval of the minutes of the September 19, 2017 meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Elliott Perkins

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

2. 1324 Magazine St.

Application: Megan Bell, applicant; 1335 Magazine LLC, owner; New construction of two adjacent, 2-story commercial buildings with landscaped access to a rear courtyard.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The window and entablature proportions at the front elevation need to be studied, should relate more to the adjacent context. Ground floor openings will require landings, and consider a method of security for the recessed entries. The ARC suggested that awnings between the pilasters on the Magazine St elevation would be more pedestrian friendly and would tie in with the overhangs of the adjacent buildings, but they understand the concern of leasing the air rights from the city.

Result: Passed

In Favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

3. 1123 St. Anthony St.

Application: Loretta Harmon, applicant; Timothy M McDonald, owner; New construction of a three-story, mixed-use building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer the application for additional review. The ARC agreed the semi-delineation of the units creates an intermediary condition that is between a single structure and multi-building proposal. The ARC agreed that the proposal should either be a single unified building, or an ensemble of individual buildings. Additionally, various elements across the proposal appeared odd and inappropriate. These include, on the St. Claude Street elevation, the parking space with the false facade, adjacent shed roof, single set of pilasters, chunky brackets at a single balcony, and the inconsistent use of operable wood shutters. At the St Anthony street elevation, the oddities include the recessed balcony, the reduced windows at the first unit, the single window at the third floor of the last unit, and the French doors with sidelights at the 3rd floor. The ARC agreed these French doors and sidelights were not successful and recommended reworking them to reflect a more traditional form. The ARC agreed that the St Anthony street elevation appears diminutive compared to that of the St Claude St elevation. They recommended incorporating more of a presence that relates to the pedestrian traffic at this elevation. Additionally, the proposed HVAC units on the North Rampart St elevation appear highly visible from St. Anthony Street and recommended further investigation in shifting those units to a visibly obscured location. The ARC requested that additional pedestrian perspectives be included in the next proposal presentation.

Result: Passed

In Favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

4. 1119 St. Anthony St.

Application: Loretta Harmon, applicant; Timothy M McDonald, owner; Renovation of existing one-story residential building including the total replacement/new construction of existing camelback addition.

Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the recommendations of the ARC with details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC recommended raising the windows on the front elevation of the camelback as they are too close to the roofline and adding brackets to the rear overhang. The ARC also suggested the option of shifting the reconstructed camelback forward on the building to eliminate the cantilever at the rear.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In Favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

5. 1115 St. Anthony St.  
Application: Loretta Harmon, applicant; Timothy M McDonald, owner; New construction of a three-story, single-family residential building with garage structure.  
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that the two (2) garage openings at the front elevation dedicate too much of the first floor to vehicles and are not appropriate for the historic district. The agreed that the windows and doors at the second floor appears squat and the roof pitch is too high. They suggested breaking up the roof mass and rather than extend the roof out over the balcony to instead provide a break and incorporate an individual kick out roof over the balcony. The ARC recommended reducing the spaces and further investigation of massing and proportions as they apply to various building typologies. The ARC suggested utilizing a stucco clad Creole townhouse typology in revising this proposal.  
Second: Wayne Troyer  
Result: Passed  
In Favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi  
Opposed:  
Comments:
6. 625 Second St.  
Application: Keith Marrero, applicant; Ollie F Hunter, owner; Renovation of existing one story residential building, including changes to the openings at the front elevation.  
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend denial of the changes to the openings at the front elevation. The addition at the rear and new side entry is appropriate and can be reviewed at the staff level. The ARC agreed that the applicant should consider an awning over the side entry.  
Second: Robbie Cangelosi  
Result: Passed  
In favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi  
Opposed:  
Comments:
7. 1211 Magazine St.  
Comments: This item was deferred to the end of the agenda.
8. 500 Elmira St.  
Comments: This item was withdrawn
9. 3815 Royal St.  
Application: Seth Welty, applicant; Georgia Y Graham, owner; One-story addition to existing one-story residential building.  
Motion: Wayne Troyer made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC felt that the general approach and materiality of the proposed addition are appropriate, but the roof configuration needs further study. The roof should be further integrated with the existing building, with a steeper pitch that makes the roof more visible. The eave line should be at the same level as the existing eave, but the roof ridge could be set slightly lower than the existing ridge. Alternately, the proposed low slope roof could remain, provided it is visually separated from the existing building by breaking the mass between the two roof forms.  
Second: Cynthia Dubberley  
Result: Passed  
In favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi  
Opposed:  
Comments:

10. 4841 Canal St.

Application: Gregory Hackenberg, applicant; St John Cemetery Assn Inc, St John Cemetery Assn Inc, owner; Small addition within the interior courtyard of a Landmark Building; addition includes an exterior restroom and storage area.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- Approval of option 2, as per the drawings.
- Finish with a hard trowel smooth finish stucco.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

11. 1215 Marais St.

Application: Charles Perkins, applicant; Charles E Perkins, owner; Lateral extension of side gable and construction of dormer at rear elevation.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments: Elliott Perkins recused himself.

12. 210 State St.

Application: Amanda Rivera, applicant; Children's Hospital, Dept Of Transportation & Development, owner; Adaptive reuse of an existing landmark building, including changes to the openings at the rear elevation.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend denial of the changes to the openings at the rear elevation. The ARC suggested that a material shift at the opening would be more successful than the brick infill. If a window is desired, the existing transom windows should remain and the new opening installed below.

Second: Wayne Troyer

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

13. 1615 Esplanade Ave.

Comments: This item was withdrawn

14. 1619 Ursulines Ave.  
Application: Tracie Ashe, applicant; Manta Properties LLC, owner; New construction of a two story, 2-unit residential building, and a two story, 1-unit residential building.  
Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.  
Second: Cynthia Dubberley  
Result: Passed  
In favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi  
Opposed:  
Comments:
15. 1807-1809 Henriette Delille St.  
Application: Robert Roth, applicant; Henry B III Eckers, owner; Renovation and camelback addition on existing one-story, two-family residential building.  
Motion: Elliott Perkins  
Second: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC recommended removing the hip roof at the gable on the front elevation of the camelback addition, changing the rear hipped roof to a gable, and increasing the height of the windows on the front elevation of the camelback.  
Result: Passed  
In favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi  
Opposed:  
Comments:
16. 1801 -1805 Henriette Delille St.  
Application: Robert Roth, applicant; Henry B III Eckers, owner; Structural renovation of existing one-story commercial building to include modification to front facade, second floor addition and balcony.  
Motion: Wayne Troyer made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that the Building Code and Zoning regulations regarding the development of this parcel need clarification to provide a recommendation. The current proposal as presented appears to be a Demolition and New Construction and as such are subject to an HDLC property assessment and Commission review and approval. Additionally, the New Construction portion of the proposal would be subject to the current Flood Ordinance and Zoning setbacks, which may potentially require substantial revisions to the proposal. The ARC recommended meeting with the Zoning Administrator, Safety & Permits, and the HDLC to determine the limitations and requirements in developing this site.  
Second: Robbie Cangelosi  
Result: Passed  
In favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi  
Opposed:  
Comments:
17. 932 Gallier St.  
Application: Samuel Bavido, applicant; Adam Z Crosson, owner; Rear and side addition to existing single-family residential building.  
Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. Please submit one set of final detailed drawings for staff review.  
Second: Wayne Troyer  
Result: Passed  
In favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi  
Opposed:  
Comments:

18. 920 Delaronde St.

Application: Darrin Champagne, applicant; Darrin L Champagne, owner; New construction of one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- The roof pitch of the building should be reduced.
- Louvered wood shutters should be installed at the front window openings to provide impact resistance and improve the proportions of the façade.
- The divisions should be eliminated from the front door glass. The doors should each have a single pane of glass over a single panel.

Second: Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

19. 925 Sixth St.

Application: Gunner Guidry - Guns Modern, applicant; Sunsin Enterprises, owner; New construction of two-family residential building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer this application for additional information from Zoning and the arborist. The building should be pushed back to allow for the gallery to extend the length of the building without damaging the tree.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

20. 951 St Mary St.

Comments: This item was withdrawn.

21. 953 St Mary St.

Comments: This item was withdrawn.

22. 4534 St Charles Ave.

Application: Scott Ryan, applicant; Richard D. Farrell, owner; Modification to an existing dormer window

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC recommended removing the original 3/3 true divided light wood window and installing a new 3/3 or 6/6 wood window to fit into the larger opening. The ARC recommended working with staff to determine the most appropriate window configuration to create a cohesive dormer element across the elevation.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

23. 1211 Magazine St.

Application: D3 Contractors, LLC, applicant; 1209 -11 Magazine LLC, owner; Construct camelback addition to existing one story, residential building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to grant conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

At this time, there being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.